Downloading a Billion Files in Python

A case study in multi-threading, multi-processing, and asyncio

James Saryerwinnie



There is a remote server that stores files



There is a remote server that stores files

The files can be accessed through a REST API



There is a remote server that stores files

The files can be accessed through a REST API

Our task is to download all the files on the remote server to our client machine



What client machine will this run on?

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

How many files are on the remote server?

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

How many files are on the remote server?

Approximately one billion files, 100 bytes per file

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

How many files are on the remote server?

Approximately one billion files, 100 bytes per file

When do you need this done?

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

How many files are on the remote server?

Approximately one billion files, 100 bytes per file

When do you need this done?

Please have this done as soon as possible



GET /list



GET /list



GET /list?next-marker=token



GET /list?next-marker=token



GET /list	{"FileNames": ["file1", "file2",]}
GET /list?next-marker={token}	<pre>{"FileNames": ["file1", "file2",], "NextMarker": "pagination-token"}</pre>
GET /get/{filename}	(File blob content)

Caveats

This is a simplified case study.

The results shown here don't necessarily generalize.

Not an apples to apples comparison, each approach does things slightly different

Sometimes concrete examples can be helpful

Caveats

This is a simplified case study.

The results shown here don't necessarily generalize.

Not an apples to apples comparison, each approach does things slightly different

Sometimes concrete examples can be helpful

Always profile and test for yourself

Synchronous Version

Simplest thing that could possibly work.


























Synchronous



Synchronous



```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    response = requests.get(list_url)
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
    while True:
        for filename in content['FileNames']:
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            download_file(remote_url,
                          os.path.join(outdir, filename))
        if 'NextMarker' not in content:
            break
        response = requests.get(
            f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}')
        response.raise_for_status()
        content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
```

```
response = requests.get(list_url)
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
while True:
    for filename in content['FileNames']:
        remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
        download_file(remote_url,
                      os.path.join(outdir, filename))
    if 'NextMarker' not in content:
        break
    response = requests.get(
        f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextMarker"]}')
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
```

```
response = requests.get(list_url)
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
while True:
    for filename in content['FileNames']:
        remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
        download_file(remote_url,
                      os.path.join(outdir, filename))
    if 'NextMarker' not in content:
        break
    response = requests.get(
        f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextMarker"]}')
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    response = requests get(list url)
```

```
response = requests.get(list_url)
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
while True:
```

```
content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
   hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
   list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
   get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
   response = requests.get(list_url)
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
   while True:
        for filename in content['FileNames']:
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            download_file(remote_url,
                          os.path.join(outdir, filename))
        if 'NextMarker' not in content:
            break
        response = requests.get(
            f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextMarker"]}')
        response.raise_for_status()
        content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    response = requests.get(list_url)
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
    while True:
        for filename in content['FileNames']:
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
         download_file(remote_url,
                          os.path.join(outdir, filename))
        if 'NextMarker' not in content:
            break
        response = requests.get(
            f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}')
        response.raise_for_status()
        content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def download_file(remote_url, local_filename):
    response = requests.get(remote_url)
    response.raise_for_status()
    with open(local_filename, 'wb') as f:
        f.write(response.content)
```

One request



One request 0.003 seconds

One billion requests

3,000,000 seconds

One request



One billion requests

3,000,000 seconds 833.3 hours

One request

0.003 seconds

One billion requests

3,000,000 seconds 833.3 hours 34.7 days



List Files can't be parallelized.

queue.Queue

But Get File can be parallelized.



List Files can't be parallelized.



But Get File can be parallelized.



List Files can't be parallelized.





One thread calls List Files and puts the filenames on a queue.Queue But Get File can be parallelized.









```
def download_files(host, port, outdir, num_threads):
    # ... same constants as before ...
   work_queue = queue.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    result_queue = queue.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
   threads = []
    for i in range(num_threads):
       t = threading.Thread(
            target=worker_thread, args=(work_queue, result_queue))
       t.start()
       threads.append(t)
    result_thread = threading.Thread(target=result_poller,
                                     args=(result_queue,))
    result_thread.start()
    threads.append(result_thread)
```

...

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir, num_threads):
    # ... same constants as before ...
   work_queue = queue.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    result_queue = queue.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
   threads = []
    for i in range(num_threads):
       t = threading.Thread(
        target=worker_thread, args=(work_queue, result_queue))
       t.start()
       threads.append(t)
    result_thread = threading.Thread(target=result_poller,
                                     args=(result_queue,))
    result_thread.start()
    threads.append(result_thread)
   # ...
```

```
response = requests.get(list_url)
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
while True:
    for filename in content['FileNames']:
        remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
        outfile = os.path.join(outdir, filename)
        work_queue.put((remote_url, outfile))
    if 'NextFile' not in content:
        break
    response = requests.get(
        f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}')
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
response = requests.get(list_url)
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
while True:
    for filename in content['FileNames']:
        remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
        outfile = os.path.join(outdir, filename)
     work_queue.put((remote_url, outfile))
    if 'NextFile' not in content:
        break
    response = requests.get(
        f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}')
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
def worker_thread(work_queue, result_queue):
    while True:
        work = work_queue.get()
        if work is _SHUTDOWN:
            return
        remote_url, outfile = work
        download_file(remote_url, outfile)
        result_queue.put(_SUCCESS)
```

```
def worker_thread(work_queue, result_queue):
    while True:
        work = work_queue.get()
        if work is _SHUTDOWN:
            return
        remote_url, outfile = work
        download_file(remote_url, outfile)
        result_queue.put(_SUCCESS)
```

Multithreaded Results - 10 threads

Multithreaded Results - 10 threads

One request 0.0036 seconds

Multithreaded Results - 10 threads

One request 0.0036 seconds

One billion requests

3,600,000 seconds 1000.0 hours 41.6 days

Multithreaded Results - 100 threads

Multithreaded Results - 100 threads

One request 0.0042 seconds

Multithreaded Results - 100 threads

One request 0.0042 seconds

One billion requests

4,200,000 seconds 1166.67 hours 48.6 days



Not necessarily IO bound due to low latency and small file size

GIL contention, overhead of passing data through queues

Things to keep in mind

The real code is more complicated, ctrl-c, graceful shutdown, etc.

Debugging is much harder, non-deterministic

The more you stray from stdlib abstractions, more likely to encounter race conditions

Can't use concurrent.futures map() because of large number of files
Our Task (the details)

What client machine will this run on?

We have one machine we can use, 16 cores, 64GB memory

What about the network between the client and server?

Our client machine is on the same network as the service with remote files

How many files are on the remote server?

Approximately one billion files, 100 bytes per file

When do you need this done?

Please have this done as soon as possible







parallel across multiple processes









```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
```

```
all_pages = iter_all_pages(list_url)
downloader = Downloader(host, port, outdir)
with futures.ProcessPoolExecutor() as executor:
    for page in all_pages:
        future_to_filename = {}
        for filename in page:
            future = executor.submit(downloader.download,
                                     filename)
            future_to_filename[future] = filename
        for future in futures.as_completed(future_to_filename):
            future.result()
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
   hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
   list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
   all_pages = iter_all_pages(list_url)
   downloader = Downloader(host, port, outdir)
   with futures.ProcessPoolExecutor() as executor:
     → for page in all_pages:
            future_to_filename = {}
            for filename in page:
                future = executor.submit(downloader.download,
                                         filename)
                future_to_filename[future] = filename
            for future in futures.as_completed(future_to_filename):
                future.result()
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
            hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
            list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
            all_pages = iter_all_pages(list_url)
            downloader = Downloader(host, port, outdir)
            with futures.ProcessPoolExecutor() as executor:
                for page in all_pages:
                    future_to_filename = {}
Start parallel downloads
                 for filename in page:
                        future = executor.submit(downloader.download,
                                                  filename)
                        future_to_filename[future] = filename
                    for future in futures.as_completed(future_to_filename):
                        future.result()
```

```
def download_files(host, port, outdir):
             hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
             list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
             all_pages = iter_all_pages(list_url)
             downloader = Downloader(host, port, outdir)
             with futures.ProcessPoolExecutor() as executor:
                 for page in all_pages:
                     future_to_filename = {}
                     for filename in page:
                          future = executor.submit(downloader.download,
                                                    filename)
                          future_to_filename[future] = filename
Wait for downloads to finish
                     for future in futures.as_completed(future_to_filename):
                          future.result()
```

```
def iter_all_pages(list_url):
    session = requests.Session()
    response = session.get(list_url)
    response.raise_for_status()
    content = json.loads(response.content)
    while True:
```

```
yield content['FileNames']
```

```
if 'NextFile' not in content:
```

break

```
response = session.get(
```

```
f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}')
response.raise_for_status()
content = json.loads(response.content)
```

```
class Downloader:
    # ...
    def download(self, filename):
        remote_url = f'{self.get_url}/{filename}'
        response = self.session.get(remote_url)
        response.raise_for_status()
        outfile = os.path.join(self.outdir, filename)
        with open(outfile, 'wb') as f:
            f.write(response.content)
```

One request 0.00032 seconds

One request 0.00032 seconds

One billion requests

320,000 seconds 88.88 hours

One request 0.00032 seconds

One billion requests

320,000 seconds 88.88 hours 3.7 days

Things to keep in mind

Speed improvements due to truly running in parallel

Debugging is much harder, non-deterministic, pdb doesn't work out of the box

IPC overhead between processes higher than threads

Tradeoff between entirely in parallel vs. parallel chunks



















Move on to the next page and start creating tasks.



This immediately starts the download.

Move on to the next page and start creating tasks.



Move on to the next page and start creating tasks.




















will finish downloading their file.





All in a single process

All in a single thread

Switch tasks when waiting for IO

Should keep CPU busy

will finish downloading their file.

```
import asyncio
from aiohttp import ClientSession
import uvloop
```

```
async def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    semaphore = asyncio.Semaphore(MAX_CONCURRENT)
    task_queue = asyncio.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    asyncio.create_task(results_worker(task_queue))
    async with ClientSession() as session:
        async for filename in iter_all_files(session, list_url):
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            task = asyncio.create_task(
                download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url,
                              os.path.join(outdir, filename))
            await task_queue.put(task)
```

import asyncio from aiohttp import ClientSession import uvloop

```
async def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    semaphore = asyncio.Semaphore(MAX_CONCURRENT)
    task_queue = asyncio.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    asyncio.create_task(results_worker(task_queue))
    async with ClientSession() as session:
        async for filename in iter_all_files(session, list_url):
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            task = asyncio.create_task(
                download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url,
                              os.path.join(outdir, filename))
            await task_queue.put(task)
```

```
import asyncio
from aiohttp import ClientSession
import uvloop
```

```
async def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    semaphore = asyncio.Semaphore(MAX_CONCURRENT)
    task_queue = asyncio.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    asyncio.create_task(results_worker(task_queue))
    async with ClientSession() as session:
        async for filename in iter_all_files(session, list_url):
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            task = asyncio.create_task(
                download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url,
                              os.path.join(outdir, filename))
            await task_queue.put(task)
```

```
import asyncio
from aiohttp import ClientSession
import uvloop
```

```
async def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    semaphore = asyncio.Semaphore(MAX_CONCURRENT)
    task_queue = asyncio.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    asyncio.create_task(results_worker(task_queue))
    async with ClientSession() as session:
        async for filename in iter_all_files(session, list_url):
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            task = asyncio.create_task(
                download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url,
                              os.path.join(outdir, filename))
            await task_queue.put(task)
```

```
import asyncio
from aiohttp import ClientSession
import uvloop
```

```
async def download_files(host, port, outdir):
    hostname = f'http://{host}:{port}'
    list_url = f'{hostname}/list'
    get_url = f'{hostname}/get'
    semaphore = asyncio.Semaphore(MAX_CONCURRENT)
    task_queue = asyncio.Queue(MAX_SIZE)
    asyncio.create_task(results_worker(task_queue))
    async with ClientSession() as session:
        async for filename in iter_all_files(session, list_url):
            remote_url = f'{get_url}/{filename}'
            task = asyncio.create_task(
                download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url,
                              os.path.join(outdir, filename))
            await task_queue.put(task)
```

```
async def iter_all_files(session, list_url):
    async with session.get(list_url) as response:
        if response.status != 200:
            raise RuntimeError(f"Bad status code: {response.status}")
        content = json.loads(await response.read())
    while True:
        for filename in content['FileNames']:
            yield filename
        if 'NextFile' not in content:
            return
        next_page_url = f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}'
        async with session.get(next_page_url) as response:
            if response.status != 200:
                raise RuntimeError(f"Bad status code: {response.status}")
            content = json.loads(await response.read())
```

```
async def iter_all_files(session, list_url):
    async with session.get(list_url) as response:
        if response.status != 200:
            raise RuntimeError(f"Bad status code: {response.status}")
        content = json.loads(await response.read())
    while True:
        for filename in content['FileNames']:
        → yield filename
        if 'NextFile' not in content:
            return
        next_page_url = f'{list_url}?next-marker={content["NextFile"]}'
        async with session.get(next_page_url) as response:
            if response.status != 200:
                raise RuntimeError(f"Bad status code: {response.status}")
            content = json.loads(await response.read())
```

```
async def download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url, local_filename):
    async with semaphore:
        async with session.get(remote_url) as response:
        contents = await response.read()
    # Sync version.
    with open(local_filename, 'wb') as f:
        f.write(contents)
        return local_filename
```

async def download_file(session, semaphore, remote_url, local_filename):
 async with semaphore:
 async with session.get(remote_url) as response:
 contents = await response.read()
 # Sync version.
 with open(local_filename, 'wb') as f:
 f.write(contents)
 return local_filename

Asyncio Results



One request

0.00056 seconds



One request



One billion requests

560,000 seconds 155.55 hours 6.48 days

Summary

Approach	Single Request Time (s)	Days
Synchronous	0.003	34.7
Multithread	0.0036	41.6
Multiprocess	0.00032	3.7
Asyncio	0.00056	6.5

Asyncio and Multiprocessing

Asyncio and Multiprocessing and Multithreading

































Combo Results


One request

0.0000303 seconds



One request 0.0000303 seconds

One billion requests

30,300 seconds



One request 0.0000303 seconds

One billion requests

30,300 seconds 8.42 hours

Summary

Approach	Single Request Time (s)	Days
Synchronous	0.003	34.7
Multithread	0.0036	41.6
Multiprocess	0.00032	3.7
Asyncio	0.00056	6.5
Combo	0.0000303	0.35

Lessons Learned

Multiple orders of magnitude difference based on approach used

Tradeoff between simplicity and speed

Need to have max bounds when using queueing or any task scheduling

Thanks!

James Saryerwinnie 🔰 🥑 🥑 jsaryer

